

Justice and Authority in Immigration Law

Colin Grey



• H A R T •
PUBLISHING

OXFORD AND PORTLAND, OREGON
2015

Published in the United Kingdom by Hart Publishing Ltd
16C Worcester Place, Oxford, OX1 2JW
Telephone: +44 (0)1865 517530
Fax: +44 (0)1865 510710
E-mail: mail@hartpub.co.uk
Website: <http://www.hartpub.co.uk>

Published in North America (US and Canada) by
Hart Publishing
c/o International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Avenue, Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213-3786
USA
Tel: +1 503 287 3093 or toll-free: (1) 800 944 6190
Fax: +1 503 280 8832
E-mail: orders@isbs.com
Website: <http://www.isbs.com>

© Colin Grey 2015

Colin Grey has asserted his right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as the author of this work.

Hart Publishing is an imprint of Bloomsbury Publishing plc.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission of Hart Publishing, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Hart Publishing Ltd at the address above.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data
Data Available

ISBN: 978-1-84946-599-1

Typeset by Compuscript Ltd, Shannon
Printed and bound in Great Britain by
CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon CR0 4YY

CONTENTS

| | |
|-------------------------------|-----|
| <i>Acknowledgements</i> | vii |
|-------------------------------|-----|

| | |
|---|----|
| Introduction | 1 |
| I. Four Predicaments | 1 |
| II. Justifying Immigration Policies: Rawls, Kant, and Smith | 3 |
| III. Some Parameters and Stipulations | 10 |

Part I: Preliminaries

| | |
|--|----|
| 1. Justice, Authority, and Immigration | 15 |
| I. Introduction | 15 |
| II. Justice and Authority | 15 |
| 1. Justice | 15 |
| 2. Authority | 17 |
| III. The Universality of Justice | 20 |
| 1. An Absolutist Objection | 20 |
| 2. Smith's Theory of Moral Judgement | 23 |
| 3. Judgements about Justice | 25 |
| 4. Why Social Justice is not a Special Relationship | 28 |
| IV. Justice and Authority in Immigration Governance | 31 |
| 1. The Problem of Justice in Immigration Governance | 31 |
| 2. The Problem of Authority in Immigration Governance | 34 |
| V. Moving on | 37 |
| 2. Inegalitarianism in Immigration Governance | 39 |
| I. Introduction | 39 |
| II. Some Considered Judgements of Injustice in Immigration | 40 |
| III. Discretionary Doctrines | 44 |
| IV. Inegalitarianism in Immigration Law | 48 |
| V. Inegalitarianism: Four Examples | 51 |
| 1. Economic Migration and Guestworker Programmes | 51 |
| 2. Family Migration | 52 |
| 3. Refugees | 54 |
| 4. Illegal Immigration | 55 |
| VI. Moving on | 56 |

x *Contents*

Part II: The Authority of Immigration Regimes

| | |
|---|-----|
| 3. The Rightful Governance of Immigration | 61 |
| I. Introduction | 61 |
| II. The Argument for the Postulate of Public Right | 63 |
| III. The Moral Standing of States and Required Forms of Partiality | 68 |
| 1. Juridical Integration and the Moral Standing of States | 69 |
| 2. Partiality Among Members..... | 73 |
| IV. The Duty to Govern Immigration Rightfully | 77 |
| 1. The Juridical Nature of Migration | 79 |
| 2. The Function of Immigration Regimes | 81 |
| V. Immigration Regimes as Status Regimes | 86 |
| 1. Status in the Governance of Immigration | 87 |
| 2. Justifying Immigration Status..... | 88 |
| 3. Status and Discretion in Immigration Governance | 91 |
| VI. Moving on | 92 |
| 4. Two Absolutisms | 93 |
| I. Introduction | 93 |
| II. An Absolutist Schematic | 96 |
| III. Communitarian Absolutism | 99 |
| 1. Complex Equality | 99 |
| 2. Complex Equality and Immigration Governance | 102 |
| 3. Domination at the Border | 104 |
| 4. Thin Morality at the Border | 106 |
| IV. Liberal Pessimism | 107 |
| 1. Immigration and Egalitarian Justice | 107 |
| 2. Pessimism about Legitimacy..... | 110 |
| 3. Hope..... | 111 |
| V. Moving on | 113 |
| 5. The Authority of Immigration Law..... | 114 |
| I. Introduction | 114 |
| II. Consent | 117 |
| III. Fairness | 122 |
| IV. The Natural Duty of Justice as a Principle of Political Obligation | 126 |
| V. How Just Immigration Regimes Can Have Authority..... | 133 |
| 1. Reasonable Deviations from Justice | 134 |
| 2. Reasonableness and Obligation | 137 |
| 3. Reasonableness in the Circumstances of Immigration | 141 |
| VI. Moving on | 145 |

Part III: Justice in Immigration Governance

| | |
|--|-----|
| 6. The Indirect Principle of Freedom of Migration..... | 149 |
| I. Introduction | 149 |
| II. Two Frameworks | 151 |
| III. The Value of Freedom of Movement | 158 |
| 1. The Capabilities and Our Considered Judgements..... | 159 |
| 2. 'An Evident Violation of Natural Liberty and Justice' | 164 |
| IV. The Global Distributive Justice Alternative | 168 |
| V. The Indirect Principle | 172 |
| 1. The Indirect Principle | 173 |
| 2. The Relevance of the Indirect Principle..... | 176 |
| 3. The Critical Force of the Indirect Principle..... | 178 |
| VI. Moving on | 180 |
| 7. Priority of Admission for the Worst-off Migrants..... | 181 |
| I. Introduction | 181 |
| II. Contextualism and Universalism | 183 |
| III. A Contextualist Universalist Method | 185 |
| IV. A Constructivist Approach to Immigration | 189 |
| V. Free and Equal Migrants | 191 |
| VI. A Basic Liberty | 194 |
| VII. A Non-lexical Liberty | 199 |
| VIII. Prioritizing the Worst off | 204 |
| IX. Principles for the Just Governance of Immigration | 207 |
| Conclusion | 210 |
| <i>Bibliography</i> | 215 |
| <i>Index</i> | 225 |